

Public Inquiry Into Foreign Interference in Federal Electoral Processes and Democratic Institutions

Enquête publique sur l'ingérence étrangère dans les processus électoraux et les institutions démocratiques fédéraux

#### **Public Hearing**

#### **Audience publique**

Commissioner / Commissaire
The Honourable / L'honorable
Marie-Josée Hogue

### VOLUME 16 ENGLISH INTERPRETATION

Held at : Tenue à:

Library and Archives Canada Bambrick Room 395 Wellington Street Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0N4

Friday, May 3, 2024

Bibliothèque et Archives Canada Salle Bambrick 395, rue Wellington Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0N4

Le vendredi 3 mai 2024

INTERNATIONAL REPORTING INC.

https://www.transcription.tc/ (800)899-0006

## II Appearances / Comparutions

Commission Lead Counsel /

Shantona Chaudhury

Procureure en chef de la commission

Commission Counsel /

Avocat(e)s de la commission Erin Dann

Matthew Ferguson

**Gordon Cameron** 

**Hubert Forget** 

Howard Krongold
Hannah Lazare

Jean-Philippe Mackay

Kate McGrann Lynda Morgan Siobhan Morris

Annie-Claude Poirier

Gabriel Poliquin
Natalia Rodriguez
Guillaume Rondeau
Nicolas Saint-Amour
Daniel Sheppard

Maia Tsurumi

Leila Ghahhary

Emily McBain-Ashfield
Hamza Mohamadhossen

Commission Research Council /

Conseil de la recherche de la

commission

Geneviève Cartier

Nomi Claire Lazar

Lori Turnbull Leah West

Commission Senior Policy Advisors /

Conseillers principaux en politiques de la

commission

Paul Cavalluzzo

Danielle Côté

## III Appearances / Comparutions

Commission Staff / Annie Desgagné
Personnel de la commission Casper Donovan

Michael Tansey

Ukrainian Canadian Congress Donald Bayne

Jon Doody

Government of Canada Gregory Tzemenakis

Barney Brucker

Office of the Commissioner of Christina Maheux

Canada Elections Luc Boucher

Nancy Miles

Human Rights Coalition Hannah Taylor

Sarah Teich

Russian Canadian Democratic Mark Power

Alliance Guillaume Sirois

Michael Chan John Chapman

Andy Chan

Han Dong Mark Polley

Emily Young

Jeffrey Wang

Michael Chong Gib van Ert

Fraser Harland

Jenny Kwan Sujit Choudhry

Mani Kakkar

# IV Appearances / Comparutions

Churchill Society Malliha Wilson

The Pillar Society Daniel Stanton

Democracy Watch Wade Poziomka

Nick Papageorge

Canada's NDP Lucy Watson

Conservative Party of Canada Nando de Luca

Chinese Canadian Concern Group on

The Chinese Communist Party's

**Human Rights Violations** 

Neil Chantler

Erin O'Toole Thomas W. Jarmyn

Preston Lim

Senator Yuen Pau Woo Yuen Pau Woo

### V Table of Content / Table des matières

Press conference by Commissioner Hogue/	
Conférence de presse par la commissaire Hogue	

**PAGE** 1

1	Ottawa, Ontario
2	The press conference starts on Friday, May 3, 2024, at
3	12:15 p.m.
4	COMMISSIONER HOGUE: Hello, everyone. Thank
5	you for your attendance today for this milestone in the
6	Public Inquiry into Foreign Interference. Your presence
7	speaks to your interest in our democracy and to the
8	importance of the issues that this Commission is concerned
9	with.
10	First of all, I'd like to remind everyone
11	that we are on the traditional territory of the Algonquin
12	Anishinaabe people.
13	I am pleased to inform you, although you
14	probably know this, that the Commission on Foreign
15	Interference, over which I preside, submitted its initial
16	report to the government today. This report examines how
17	actors interfered or attempted to interfere in the 2019 and
18	2021 federal elections and, if so, the impact of that
19	interference.
20	It also discusses how information about
21	foreign interference was circulated within the federal
22	government and what measures were taken in response to this
23	information.
24	The report is available on the Commission's
25	website where anyone who wishes to read it may do so. This
26	report is the fruit of months of investigation and 21 days of
27	hearings, 15 public and six held in camera, during which we
28	heard from 66 people, including victims of foreign

1	interference, members of diaspora communities, the heads of
2	our intelligence agencies, many civil servants, former and
3	current politicians, Ministers, as well as the Prime
4	Minister.
5	I would like to express my gratitude to all
6	these people for their invaluable contributions and testimony
7	as well as to the members of the Commission team for their
8	massive efforts thus far.
9	Thanks also to the translation and
10	interpreting team whose hard work enables the public to
11	follow the Commission's work in either official language.
12	My team and I read and analyzed a large
13	number of documents, many of them highly classified. The
14	Commission had access to the documents it deemed relevant
15	without any redaction for national security reasons. I can
16	therefore say that our team was able to conduct our
17	investigative work without limiting access to classified
18	information.
19	The Commission had access to all documents it
20	deemed relevant without any redactions for national security
21	reasons. I can therefore say that our team was able to
22	conduct our investigative work without limitation or access
23	to
24	As you will know, since I have said it many
25	times before, the Commission had to face the immense
26	challenge of balancing the protection of Canada's national
27	security interests with the transparency of its work. I

strongly believe we have been successful in striking this

1 balance.

Despite extreme time constraints, the

Commission found ways to make a substantial amount of
information and documents available to the public, enabling
citizens to come to know and understand what happened during
the last two elections. Nevertheless, certain facts cannot
be publicly disclosed for national security reasons. The
report, therefore, includes a classified supplement which, in
accordance with the law and the Commission's Terms of
Reference, is only available to those with the requisite
security clearance and who also have a need to know stemming
from the performance of their duties.

To maximize transparency, I have disclosed as much information as possible in the public report itself while limiting the information contained in the classified supplement only to what is strictly necessary. This classified information in no way alters the main finding of the report. On the contrary, it reinforces some of those findings.

It's important to highlight that the initial report's findings are not necessarily definitive. The Commission will soon begin the second stage of its work, and it is possible that this stage will shed further light or even a different light on some of the events investigated and reported in the first stage. Indeed, the manner in which information about foreign interference was circulated and what measures the government took in response are two issues central to the second stage of our work, which focuses on the

government's ability to detect, prevent and counter foreign
interference.

It's important to highlight that the initial report's findings are not necessarily definitive. The Commission will soon begin the second stage of its work, and it is possible that this stage will shed further light or even a different light on some of the events investigated and reported in the first stage. Indeed, the manner in which information about foreign interference was circulated and what measures the government took in response are two issues central to the second stage of our work, which focuses on the government's ability to detect, prevent and counter foreign interference.

The findings in this initial report should, therefore, be understood for what they are; preliminary findings which may be subject to change upon the completion of the Commission's work. That said, I do not think it likely that the main conclusion in this report will change.

 $\label{eq:them-of-them} \mbox{The $--$ however, I will now outline some of them for you here.}$ 

First, our electoral system is robust.

Active foreign interference did occur during the last two general -- federal general elections, but they did not undermine the integrity of our electoral system. Our system remains sound. Voters were able to cast their ballots, their votes were duly registered and counted, and there is nothing to suggest that there was any interference whatsoever in this regard, nor did this foreign interference have any impact on

which Party formed the government in the last two most recent
elections.

Nonetheless, these acts of interference that occurred, some of these acts have been established, while others remain only suspected, are a stain on our electoral process and impacted the process leading up to the actual vote.

Although it is impossible to determine whether they had an impact on the number of votes received by each candidate in any of the ridings affected, there is one riding where disinformation may have led to the election of one candidate over another, but I cannot say for sure.

Whether or not this is the case, the mere possibility that disinformation carried out or encouraged by a foreign authority could have had a decisive impact on the result in a constituency is serious. Furthermore, this disinformation, even if it did not have a decisive impact on several constituencies, did diminish the ability of some voters to cast their ballots in an informed manner, that is to say, with the benefit of reliable information.

First, our electoral system is robust. Acts of foreign interference did occur during the last two federal general elections, but they did not undermine the integrity of our electoral system. Our system remains sound. Voters were able to cast their ballots, their votes were duly registered and counted, and there is nothing to suggest that there was any interference whatsoever in this regard, nor did this foreign interference have any impact on which Party

vote.

formed the government in the two most recent elections.

Nonetheless, the acts of interference that occurred, some of these acts have been established while others remain only suspected, are a stain on our electoral process and impacted the process leading up to the actual

Although it is impossible to determine whether they had an impact on the number of votes received by each candidate in any of the ridings affected, there is one riding where disinformation may have led to the election of one candidate over another, but I cannot say for sure.

The ways in which information was communicated or failed to be communicated to some individuals or groups is also a reason to pause for thought. I have not found evidence of any actions taken in bad faith, but I have found that there were some communication problems and a certain lack of understanding of the role that everyone plays or should play in combating foreign interference.

I have found no evidence of any actions taken in bad faith, but I have found that there were some communication problems and a certain lack of understanding of the role that everyone plays or should play in combating foreign interference.

Foreign interference often specifically targets diaspora communities. Members of these communities have reported their distress when they found themselves beset by foreign powers and the impact this had on their lives. We cannot and must not remain indifferent to their distress.

This brings me to a few general observations. Foreign interference is a real occurrence and a serious threat, and one that is probably impossible to completely irradicate, but we must do all that we can to detect, prevent and counter it. In the next phase of the Commission's work, we will need to deepen our understanding of the mechanisms that generate or facilitate foreign interference. 

We have already identified two such mechanisms, disinformation and financial support. We need to investigate further, including by examining the rules governing how candidates are chosen in nomination contests and those governing how the intelligence agencies can conduct their work. We also need to examination how communication problems within the government may be an obstacle to effectively combatting foreign interference.

Foreign interference is a real occurrence and a serious threat, and one that is probably impossible to completely irradicate, but we must do all that we can to detect, prevent and counter it. In the next phase of the Commission's work, we will need to deepen our understanding of the mechanisms that generate or facilitate foreign interference.

We have already identified two such mechanisms, disinformation and financial support. We need to investigate further, including by examining the rules governing how candidates are chosen in nomination contests and those governing how the intelligence agencies can conduct

1	their work. We also need to examine how communication
2	problems within the government may be an obstacle to
3	effectively combatting foreign interference.
4	That said, solutions to counter
5	disinformation, to improve how information about foreign
6	interference is circulated or, more broadly, to respond to
7	such interference remain elusive.
8	These are, of course, complex issues in
9	themselves, but the number of considerations make the task
10	particularly challenging in the Canadian context. Protecting
11	national security and the neutrality of our senior civil
12	servants are important principles, but they also pose
13	challenges.
14	More fundamentally, Canada is a multicultural
15	and democratic society that recognizes and protects
16	individual rights and the rule of law. The rights to
17	reputation and privacy, the right to vote, freedom of
18	expression and freedom of opinion are at the heart of who we
19	are. We must also avoid taking measures that would
20	stigmatize some of our fellow citizens, particularly those
21	from diasporas, but all that makes it much more difficult to
22	fight foreign interference, which is generally, but not
23	exclusively, the work of authoritarian regimes.
24	To a certain extent, it is an uneven battle.
25	This is not to say that we should abandon the values
26	foundational to our society. That would be a trap, one that
27	some would be only too happy to see us fall into. Rather, it
28	means that finding ways to identify and respond to foreign

28

interference and formulating useful recommendations for doing 1 so is no small task. 2 3 More fundamentally, Canada is a multicultural and democratic society that recognizes and protects 4 individual rights and the rule of law. The rights to 5 6 reputation and privacy, the right to vote, freedom of 7 expression and freedom of opinion are at the heart of who we are. We must also avoid taking measures that will stigmatize 8 some of our fellow citizens, particularly those from 9 diasporas, but all that makes it that much more difficult to 10 fight foreign interference, which is generally, but not 11 exclusively, the work of authoritarian regimes. 12 To a certain extent, it is an uneven battle. 13 14 This is not to say, though, that we should abandon the values 15 foundational to our society. That would be a trap, one that some will be only too happy to see us fall into. Rather, it 16 means that finding ways to identify and respond to foreign 17 interference and formulating useful recommendations for doing 18 19 so is no small task. We are continuing our work, and this fall we 20 will be holding more public hearings during which we'll hear 21 22 further crucial testimony, including from experts who will help us identify concrete, effective measures. We will 23 tackle the major challenge of identifying potential solutions 24 25 and then formulate recommendations to best protect our country from foreign interference. 26

31st, 2024. In the meantime, I encourage you to read my

My final report will be submitted by December

1	initial report. You will find in it a 15-page summary
2	entitled "Report Highlights", followed by eight substantive
3	chapters.
4	I hope that this report adds publicly to the
5	understanding of foreign interference and its impact in the
6	last two general elections.
7	In addition, I also urge anyone who has
8	relevant information to provide it to the Commission through
9	the forthcoming public outreach initiative, which will be
10	accessible on our website.
11	So in addition, I also urge anyone who has
12	relevant information to provide it to the Commission through
13	the forthcoming public outreach initiative, which will be
14	accessible on our website.
15	Thank you again for being here.
16	Thank you again for being here and have a
17	great weekend.
18	As it was mentioned, I won't answer any
19	questions for the time being. It's an interim report.
20	There's some work that still needs to be conducted.
21	Upon concluding at 12:35 p.m.
22	
23	The press conference concluded at 12:35 p.m.
24	
25	
26	
20	

1	CERTIFICATION
2	
3	I, Sandrine Marineau-Lupien, a certified court reporter,
4	hereby certify the foregoing pages to be an accurate
5	transcription of my notes/records to the best of my skill and
6	ability, and I so swear.
7	
8	Je, Sandrine Marineau-Lupien, une sténographe officielle,
9	certifie que les pages ci-hautes sont une transcription
10	conforme de mes notes/enregistrements au meilleur de mes
11	capacités, et je le jure.
12	
13	My ups
14	Sandrine Marineau-Lupien
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	